Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

?BÄ?U?85ˇN Report by the Mission Members to the ACTU and the TDC
5 ˇU?j?N July AGPS Canberra
N5 ˇj?l?(N
N2 ˇl?¢?6(5ˇN Dunphy D. and Stace D. 1990 Under New
0
ˇ¢?◊?52ˇN Management: Australian Organisations in Transition
2 ˇ◊?Ï?N McGraw-Hill Sydney
N2 ˇÏ?Ó?˝ˇ(N
N#' ˇÓ?˝ˇÓ?ˇ
(ˇN . . . . . .
. . . N#' ˇÓ?&@8(7ˇN Genn J. 1982 The Pursuit of
Excellence " ˇ&@[@433N in University Teaching in
Australia HERDSA Sydney #' ˇ[@]@(N
N ˇ]@ï@8(7ˇN Halsey A. and Trow M.(with the assistance
of N6Ä ˇï@Õ@87ˇN O. Fulton) 1971 The
British Academics Faber and ˇÕ@›@
N Faber London
N ˇ›@fl@(N
N6Ä ˇfl@A9(8ˇN Halsey A. 1976 Academic Freedom and
the $Ä ˇAQA98ˇN Idea of a University: The 17th TB Davie
Memorial lecture 6Ä ˇQAÖA40ˇN delivered in the
University of Capetown 8th June N6Ä ˇÖAùAN
University of Capetown
N6Ä ˇùAüA(N
N
@Ä ˇüA–A1 (0ˇN Jaspers K. 1959 The Idea of the
%Ä ˇ–AB63ˇN University (trans. H. Reiche and H. Vanderschmidt)

@Ä ˇ†D»GÌi†D/D:9ˇN review of the year in The University of
Sydney Annual ! ˇ/DE:9ˇN Report 1 January to 31
December 1990 The University of $& ˇEEN Sydney
N$& ˇEE(N
N$& ˇERE3(2ˇN Macquarie University 1988 Act of
N$& ˇREÉE1 0ˇN Incorporation:Macquarie University 1964-1986 in
N$& ˇÉEœE:99N Macquarie University Calendar Macquarie University
NSW - ˇœE¿E(N
N- ˇ¿EˇE9(8ˇN Massaro V. 1991 Tomorrow's university-
an # ˇˇE+F20ˇN owner's manual Australian Campus
Review Weekly Ä ˇ+FCFN September 12-18
V1 N5 NÄ ˇCFEF(N
NÄ ˇEFF:(9ˇN Neumann R. 1990 Research and
Scholarship: $Ä ˇFµF65ˇN Perceptions of Senior Academic
Administrators Paper -Ä ˇµFÌF87ˇN presented at
the Australian association for Research in N-Ä ˇÌF
$G76ˇN Education Conference, Sydney 27 November - 2 December
N-Ä ˇ$G*GN 1990
N-Ä ˇ*G,G(N
N-Ä ˇ,GaG5(4ˇN O'Brien J. 1990a "Reconstructing the
N-Ä ˇaGïG43ˇN Academic Worker: Industrial Relations in the Higher
N-Ä ˇïG«G100N Education Sector" Discourse V10, N2, 1-21

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

,Ä ˇ«G»Gˇ
N .....
....N ,Ä ˇigatory and time consuming. Committee work involves an enormous amount of time, energy and money (Genn, 1982). The demand to serve on committees effectively bureaucratises academics.

Yet the academic's work on committees is as important as it guards one of the main purposes of institutionalised research, namely to maintain and develop an imaginative and creative intellectual ethos, so that the momentum and conditions for creativity in research can be maintained (Stephenson, 1984). The ambiguity of academic practice lies in the fact that, legally, the vice-chancellor of a university is the employer of the academics of the university, even though the vice-chancellor is appointed by the governing body made up of the academics, who are the vice-chancellor's employees (Macquarie University, 1988; University of Sydney 1987).

The scholar must be considered as the core structure of the university. The disciplines provide the real environment for the work of the academic. The term "academic practice" is more accurate than "academic work". It is a self-authorising, self-directing, self-managing form of employment. The university as an outcome of this ef alternative scientific structure to rational organisation which may help interpret academic practice and its outcomes is the holistic system. A holistic system is made up of a multitude of objects, but has to be pictured as one indivisible, dynamic whole, whose parts are interrelated, and can be understood only as patterns of a universal process (Capra, 1982).

A holistic structure is a self-organising system. A self-organising system does not rely on an outside organiser but organises itself (De Bono, 1990). It is a synthesising dynamic, not a reductionist dynamic. The logic of creativity arises directly from the assymetric patterns that inevitably form in it (De Bono, 1990). This is not a rational logic.

The life of such a system is not a cumulative phenomenon, as in a rational organisation (Davies, 183). The dynamic and its emergent quality comes from the pattern of association, from the appropriate complex arrangement that forms the whole (Davies, 1983). Rational organisations deal only with the component level, so are included in the systems level, but are lesser than that level (Davies, 1983).

Academic Practice Industrially Examined

The nature of academic work should be demonstrated in the industrial relations of academics, universities and governments. The integrated nature of the university and of academic practice was codified by the attempts during the 1960s to establish a coherent and national body to set academic salaries. The 1964 Eggleston Inquiry to set the salary of professors, and by implication the salaries of other grades of academic staff as a fraction of this, was aware that, unlike the hierarchy of a rational organisation, the qualifications for a lecturer and professor were the same. The differences lay in responsibility and experience (The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia, 1964).

That Inquiry found academic practice to be sui generis, and the position of university professor unlike any other position (The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia, 1964). It also acknowledged the

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

international labour market for university academics (The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia, 1964). Unfortunately sui generis was not clarified, or analysed in any occupationally meaningful manner. The 1970 Eggleston Inquiry came to a similar conclusion to the 1964 Inquiry. The salaries of professors provided a ceiling whereby the salaries of all grades could be set (The Parliament of Australia, 1970).

Unlike the 1964 Inquiry it recommended an adversarial procedure for the setting of academic salaries, as it felt the AVCC and FAUSA were in collusion, and that there was no adequate opposing argument (The Parliament of Australia, 1970). In this recommendation Justice Eggleston was contradicting his earlier finding of sui generis, academic practice as an integrated whole. He was imposing the assumptions of conventional industrial procedures on academics and universities.

The Campbell Inquiry of 1973 re-asserted the findings of the 1964 Eggleston Inquiry. It extended the range of its recommendations to include tutors and demonstrators, as a fraction of the Lecturer grade (The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia, 1973).

On the recommendation of the Campbell Inquiry, the Academic Salaries Tribunal, a sub-tribunal of the Remunerations Tribunal, was established in 1974 (Bowen, 1974). The Tribunal was empowered to report on the salaries of vice-chancellors, principals, other chief executive officers, registrars and bursars as well as the other grades of academics (Bowen, 1974).

Attacks on academic practice, such as the review of study leave from 1977 to 1979, when the Working Party of the Tertiary Education Commission tried to institute the "teaching-man week", as a new principle by which to measure academic practice (TEC, 1978a), highlighted the need for protection of academic conditions of practice. Though reduced, and attempts made to limit it to Australia only, (TEC, 1978b) study leave was kept because of the cost of not having it (TEC, 1978b). The TEC was forced to acknowledge the inseparability of teaching and research both in universities and CAEs (TEC, 1978b)

The limitations of the Academic Salaries Tribunal, which could only decide for universities in the Commonwealth Territories, and only make recommendations for the States' universities; the fact that it could not decide or recommend on conditions for academic practice, were two of the factors which encouraged FAUSA to seek registration with the Conciliation and Arbitration Commission (Bowen, 1974; Wallis, 1979a; Wallis, 1979b). It was this registration which was used by Dawkins to co-erce academics into rational management conditions (Dawkins,1988).

The Dawkins Restructure is not secure because of the integrated nature of the university. There has been a significant movement of academics from Australian universities to overseas universities, and early retirements (DEET, 1991; West, 1991a). The loss of academics to overseas universities is not a loss to scholarship and discipline, as is early retirement.

Amalgamations between universities and CAEs, or the amalgamation of CAEs into a larger university, have not gone smoothly in all cases (DEET, 1991; West, 1991b; Leech, 1991). CAE staff have begun to find themselves overworked as the demand to research is placed onto their teaching load (DEET, 1991). Uniformity is now seen as unhealthy, and some former CAEs are

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

retaining differences by claiming excellence as teaching universities (DEET, 1991; Massaro, 1991). One Vice-Chancellor, at least, is still mindful that he is primus inter pares as well as a Chief Executive Officer (McNichol, 1991).

Conclusion

The co-incidence of the juncture of academic practice and academic paid employment creates the real problem for determining the remuneration and conditions for academics. It is the problem of the nexus between the rational paradigm and the holistic paradigm. Rational modes of structure and process do not, and can not recognise universalistic modes of structure and process.

Rational order is, by definition, not able to control a holistic, self-organising system of practice, such as the disciplines which are embodied locally at a university. The establisher of principles can not be ruled by those, who only understand principles that have already been established, and may be found wanting to solve new problems, which require new paradigms. The technocratic manager does not have this expertise. To define academic practice by the principles of industrial or bureaucratic work is a misunderstanding of that practice.

REFERENCES:

Bowen N., MP, Special Minister of State, and Minister Assisting the Prime Minister in Matters Relating to the Public Service 1974 Second Reading of the Remunerations Tribunals Bill 19th. September in Parliamentary Debates (Hansard) House of Representatives: First Session of the Twenty-Ninth Parliament (First Period) 9th. July to 5th. December 1974 AGPS Canberra

Burbules N. 1986 " A Theory of Power in Education" Educational Theory

Capra F. 1982 The Turning Point: Science Society and the Rising Culture Flamingo/Fontana UK

Clark B. 1984 The Organisational Concept in Perspectives on Higher Education: Eight Disciplinary and Comparative Views (ed. B.Clark) University of California Press USA

Commonwealth Tertiary Education Commission 1984 Report for the 1985-1987 Triennium: Recommendations and Guidelines AGPS Canberra

Dawkins J. The Hon. Minister for Employment, Education and Training 1987 Higher Education: A Policy Discussion Paper December AGPS Canberra

Dawkins J. The Hon. Minister for Employment, Education and Training 1988 Higher Education: A Policy Statement July AGPS Canberra

Davies P. 1983 God and the New Physics Penguin UK

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

De Bono E. 1990 I Am Right You Are Wrong From This to The New Renaissance: From Rock Logic to Water Logic Viking UK

Department of Employment, Education and Training 1991 Study of the Labour Market for Academics by J. Sloan and M. Baker with R.Blandy, F. Robertson, W. Brummitt of The National Institute of Labour Studies, Flinders University of South Australia December 1990 AGPS Canberra

Department of Trade 1987 Australia Reconstructed: ACTU/TDC Mission to Western Europe: A Report by the Mission Members to the ACTU and the TDC July AGPS Canberra

Dunphy D. and Stace D. 1990 Under New Management: Australian Organisations in Transition McGraw-Hill Sydney

Genn J. 1982 The Pursuit of Excellence in University Teaching in Australia HERDSA Sydney

Halsey A. and Trow M.(with the assistance of O. Fulton) 1971 The British Academics Faber and Faber London

Halsey A. 1976 Academic Freedom and the Idea of a University: The 17th TB Davie Memorial lecture delivered in the University of Capetown 8th June University of Capetown

Jaspers K. 1959 The Idea of the University (trans. H. Reiche and H. Vanderschmidt) Beacon Press Boston

Jones B. 1976 The Universities and the Academic Professions in The Professions in Australia: A Critical Appraisal UQP Australia

Ladd E. and Lipset S. 1973 Professors, Unions and American Higher Education Carnegie Commission on Higher Education California

Leech G. 1991 La Trobe marriage hits rocky patch over standards The Australian Wednesday September 18 p.13

McGarvie 1984 "Observations on the Birmingham 1983 Commonwealth Universities Congress: Three Urgent Problems" Vestes 27, 2, 44 - 45

McNichol D. 1991 Vice-Chancellor's review of the year in The University of Sydney Annual Report 1 January to 31 December 1990 The University of Sydney

Macquarie University 1988 Act of Incorporation:Macquarie University 1964-1986 in Macquarie University Calendar Macquarie

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

University NSW

Massaro V. 1991 Tomorrow's university- an owner's manual Australian Campus Review Weekly September 12-18 V1 N5

Neumann R. 1990 Research and Scholarship: Perceptions of Senior Academic Administrators Paper presented at the Australian association for Research in Education Conference, Sydney 27 November - 2 December 1990

O'Brien J. 1990a "Reconstructing the Academic Worker: Industrial Relations in the Higher Education Sector" Discourse V10, N2, 1-21

O'Brien J., 1990b "Universities, Technology and Academic Work: A Reconsideration of the Murray Committee on Australian Universities (1957) in the Light of Dawkins (1957-1988)" Journal of Tertiary Educational Administration V12, N1, 255-272

Saha L. 1980 "The Social Position of Academics in Australian Society: Some Objective and Subjective Perspectives" Vestes Vol.23 N.2 25 - 31

Stephenson S. 1976 "The Place of a University in a Changing Society" Vestes Vol.19, N.1, 23 - 28

Taylor F. 1911 Scientific Management: Shop Management; Principles of Scientific Management; Testimony before the Special House Committee Greenwood Press USA

Taksunas A. 1981 Unions Come to Campus a paper given to the 51st Australian and New Zealand Association for the Advancement of Science Congress ANZAAS Australia University of Queensland

Tertiary Education Commission 1978a Draft Report on Study Leave April TEC

Tertiary Education Commission 1978b Study Leave in Universities and Colleges of Advanced Education: Report of the Tertiary Education Commission August AGPS Canberra

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia 1964 Report of the Inquiry into Academic Salaries 30th. October

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia 1970 Inquiry into Academic Salaries, Mr. Justice Eggleston 7th. May AGPS Canberra

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia 1973b

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

Inquiry into Academic Salaries (Chairman W. Campbell) Report Dated May 1973 AGPS Canberra

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia 1989 Acts of the Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia Passed During the Year 1988 Vol1 AGPS Canberra

The University of Sydney 1986 Calendar 1987 University of Sydney NSW

Walker G. 1976 "Satisfaction or Frustration: The Dilemma of University Academics" Vestes V19,N1, 35-38

Wallis L. 1979a Mechanisms for the Determination of Salary and Conditions of Academic Staff 11th May FAUSA Melbourne

Wallis L. 1979b Appendix A to Mechanisms for the Determination of Salary and Conditions of Academic Staff 11th. May FAUSA Melbourne

Weber M. 1947 The Theory of Social and Economic Organization (trans. M. Henderson and T. Parsons) OUP New York

West W. 1991a Record academic shortage `inevitable' The Australian Wednesday August 21st. p.13

West W. 1991b Anti-merger lobby losing support at UNE The Australian Wednesday September 4th. p.15

White D. 1976 The Profession of Teaching in The Professions in Australia: A Critical Appraisal (P. Boreham, A. Pemberton, P. Wilson eds.) QUP Australia

Williams R. 1986 "Science and Craft : The Essential Link" The Australian Teacher Vol.14, N2., 14 - 17

Wright R. 1977 "Australian University Staffs, Their Past and Their Prospects" Vestes V20, N3, 3-8

ACADEMIC WORK:HOLISTIC OR RATIONAL?

HELEN M. FINLAY

Paper Presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Surfers' Paradise, 1991
Australian Association for Research in Education

MA(HONS) STUDENT, MACQUARIE UNIVERSITY

A paper presented to the Australian Association for Research in Education Annual Conference 1991 : Practioners, Researchers and Policy Makers: Changing Conditions?
Queensland University of Technology 26-30 November